

QUESTIONNAIRE

STATE BUDGET TRANSPARENCY SURVEY (SBTS) IN NIGERIA

YOBE STATE

January 2018

THIS QUESTIONNAIRE WAS COMPLETED BY

RESEARCHER: Idi Garba Bubaram

STATE: Yobe

ORGANIZATION: Grassroots Economic Empowerment and Educational Development
(GEcEED-Yobe)

ADDRESS: Shop No.117 Damaturu Business Complex, Adjacent Timber Market, Off
Bukar Ibrahim Way, Damaturu, Yobe State

TELEPHONE NUMBER(S): 07033056250

ORGANIZATION'S WEBSITE: Nil

E-MAIL ADDRESS: geceed2005@yahoo.co.uk

STATE SUPERVISOR:

ABUBAKAR YUSUF MADAKI

Yobe State Collage of Agriculture, Gujba, Yobe State

ZONAL CONSULTANT:

Dr. Yusufu Nigel Bachama,

Department of Economics, Gombe State University,

Email: nybachama@gmail.com; **Tel:** 07069542112

SURVEY ON STATE BUDGET TRANSPARENCY IN NIGERIA

Section One: Public Availability of Key Budget Documents

Table 1: Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

Table 2: Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles, Release Dates and Internet Links

- A. State Budget Call Circular
- B. State Budget Draft Estimates
- C. State Budget Appropriation Law
- D. State Citizens Budget
- E. Implementation Reports: State Executive's Quarterly Report, State Mid-Year Review and State Accountant-General's Report (Year-End Report)
- F. State Auditor General's Report
- G. Public Accounts Committee (PAC) Report on the Auditor General's Report

Section Two: Public Participation in the Budget Process

Section Three: Public Availability of Information on Procurement

Section Four: Legal Framework: Access to Information and Fiscal Responsibility

SECTION ONE: PUBLIC AVAILABILITY OF KEY BUDGET DOCUMENTS

TABLE 1 · BUDGET YEAR OF DOCUMENTS USED IN COMPLETING THE QUESTIONNAIRE

Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire	
<i>Please indicate below for which fiscal year responses to questions relating to each report or experience were based on.</i>	
Budget Documents	Budget Year Used
1. State Budget Call Circular	2018
2. State Draft Budget Proposals	2018
<i>State Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) and Fiscal Strategy Paper (FSP)</i>	2018-2020
3. State Budget Appropriation Law	2018
4. State Approved Budget Volumes	2018
5. State Citizens Budget	2018
6. State <i>Quarterly</i> Reports	2017Q4 or 2018Q1
7. State Mid-Year Review	2017
8. State Accountant General's Report	2016
9. State Auditor General's Report	2016
10. Public Accounts Committee (PAC) Report on Auditor General's Report	2015

TABLE 2 · KEY BUDGET DOCUMENTS USED: FULL TITLES, RELEASE DATES, INTERNET LINKS AND AVAILABILITY STATUS

Budget Document	<p>For each document, please include:</p> <p>1. Full Title; 2. Date of Release, 3. Internet Link (if the document is available online) or any other availability information, 4. Availability Status.</p>
State Budget Call Circular	<p>1.Title: Yobe State Call Circular for 2018 Budget Preparation Ref. N. MBEF/ES/S/20/VOL.1/1069</p> <p>2.Date of Release: 10/08/2017</p> <p>3.Internet Link: Nil</p> <p>4.Availability: <i>Produced and Available on Request (PAR)</i></p>
Pre-Budget Statement (Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) and Fiscal Strategy Paper (FSP))	<p>1. Title: Yobe State Government Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) 2018 to 2020</p> <p>2. Date of Release: Nil</p> <p>3. Internet Link: Nil</p> <p>4. Availability: <i>Produced for Internal Use (PIU)</i></p>
Executive Budget Proposal (State Draft Budget Estimates)	<p>1.Title: Yobe State Draft Budget Proposal, 2018</p> <p>2.Date of Release: 05/12/2017</p> <p>3.Internet Link: Nil</p> <p>4.Availability: <i>Produced for Internal Use(PIU)</i></p>
Enacted Budget (State Approved Budget)	<p>1.Title: Yobe State Approved Budget 2018</p> <p>2.Date of Release: Nil</p> <p>3.Internet Link: Nil</p> <p>4.Availability: <i>Produced for Internal Use (PIU)</i></p>
State Budget Appropriation Law	<p>1.Title: Yobe State Appropriation Law, 2018</p> <p>2.Date of Release: 16/01/2018</p> <p>3.Internet Link: https://finance.ybpfm.org/yobe-state-financial-laws/</p> <p>4.Availability: <i>Produced and Publicly Available (PPA)</i></p>
State Citizens Budget	<p>1.Title: Nil</p> <p>2.Date of Release: Nil</p> <p>3.Internet Link: Nil</p> <p>4.Availability: Not Produced (NP)</p>
In-Year Report (State Quarterly Reports)	<p>1.Title: Yobe State Government of Nigeria Fourth quarter (Q4) budget performance report 2017</p> <p>2.Date of Release: 16/02/2018</p> <p>3.Internet Link: https://finance.ybpfm.org/budget-performance-report/</p> <p>4.Availability: <i>Produced and Publicly Available (PPA)</i></p>
State Mid-Year Review	<p>1.Title: Nil</p> <p>2.Date of Release: Nil</p> <p>3.Internet Link: Nil</p> <p>4.Availability: Not Produced (NP)</p>

Budget Document	<p>For each document, please include:</p> <p>1. Full Title; 2. Date of Release, 3. Internet Link (if the document is available online) or any other availability information, 4. Availability Status.</p>
End of Year Report (State Accountant General's Report)	<p>1. Title: Report of the Accountant -General Yobe State with Financial Statements for the year ended 31st December, 2016.</p> <p>2. Date of Release: 15/05/2017</p> <p>3. Internet Link: https://finance.ybpfm.org/yobe-state-financial-statements/</p> <p>4. Availability: <i>Produced and Publicly Available</i></p>
State Auditor General's Report	<p>1. Title: Report of the Auditor-General on the Accounts of Government of Yobe State of Nigeria for the year ended 31st December, 2016.</p> <p>2. Date of Release: 15/05/2017</p> <p>3. Internet Link: https://osag.yb.gov.ng/2016.pdf</p> <p>4. Availability: <i>Produced and Publicly Available (PPA)</i></p>
Public Accounts Committee (PAC) Report on Auditor General's Report	<p>1. Title:</p> <p>2. Date of Release:</p> <p>3. Internet Link:</p> <p>4. Availability: Not Produced</p>

Note the options for Availability: (1) Produced and Publicly Available (PPA); (2) Produced and Available on Request (PAR); (3) Produced for Internal Use (PIU); (4) Not Produced (NP)

SECTION ONE: PUBLIC AVAILABILITY OF KEY BUDGET DOCUMENTS

A. STATE BUDGET CALL CIRCULAR AND CALENDAR

1. Does the State Ministry, Department or Agency in charge of Budget produce a State Budget Call Circular?
- A. Yes, it is does.
 - B. No, it is does not
 - C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: Yobe State Ministry of Budget and Planning State Budget Call Circular, 2018
10/08/2018 to State Ministries, Departments and Agencies

Comment:Q.1: "A" The State produces call circular 2018 and publicly available in State notice Board, CSO Network offices, state Ministries and extra ministerial departments.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A, Yes, the ministry of budget issues call circular to MDAs annually

CIRDDOC:

2. How far in advance of the budget year is the State Budget Call Circular released?
- A. It is released at least five months before the start of the budget year.
 - B. It is released at least four months before the start of the budget year.
 - C. It is released at least three months before the start of the budget year.
 - D. It is made publicly available released after the State Draft Budget Estimates have been presented to the State House of Assembly, or it is not produced.
 - E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: Yobe State Ministry of Budget and Planning Call Circular for 2018 Budget
Preparation Ref. No. MBEF/ES/S/20/VOL.1/1069 dated 10/08/2017 to State
Ministries, Departments and Agencies

Comment:Q.2: "C" It is released at least three months before the start of the budget year 10/08/2017.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: B, they are issued at least four months before the budget process commence

CIRDDOC:

3. Is the State Budget Call Circular made available to the general public?
- A. Yes, it is made available to the general public, in addition to being submitted to all key stakeholders
 - B. No, it is only submitted to key stakeholders including Civil Society groups, Trade Unions, Speaker and Clerk of the State House of Assembly (SHOA) and MDAs only.
 - C. No, it is only submitted to the Speaker and Clerk of the SHOA and MDAs only.
 - D. No, it is only submitted to heads of MDAs only.
 - E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: Yobe State Ministry of Budget and Planning Call Circular for 2018 Budget

Preparation Ref. No. MBEF/ES/S/20/VOL.1/1069 dated 10/08/2017 to State

Ministries, Departments and Agencies

Comment: Q.3: "A" The State Ministry of Budget and Planning made 2018 Budget Call Circular publicly available to the general public through submission to all key stakeholders and notice board of Network of Yobe Civil Society Organization.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A, budget circulars are usually given to MDAs and some stakeholders

CIRDDOC:

4. Does the budget process adhere to a publicly available calendar for preparation and release of the State Draft Budget Estimates?

- A. Yes, a detailed budget calendar is provided to the public and the deadlines are adhered to.
- B. Yes, the budget calendar is provided and two thirds of the dates are adhered to.
- C. Yes, the budget calendar is provided and less than two third of the dates are adhered to.
- D. **No, a budget calendar is not provided or there is no adherence to a timetable.**
- E. Not applicable /other (please explain).

Citation:

Comment: Q.4: 'D'

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: D, there is no fixed (annual) budget calendar

CIRDDOC:

B. STATE DRAFT BUDGET ESTIMATES (EXECUTIVE'S BUDGET PROPOSAL)

5. Does the State Ministry, Department or Agency in charge of Budget produce a State Draft Budget Estimates before the start of the fiscal year?

- A. **Yes, it does.**
- B. No, it does not [*Please specify whether the draft budget estimates are produced late, or not produced at all*].
- C. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: State Draft Budget Estimates, presented to State House of Assembly on 06/12/2017 by the Executive Governor

Comment: Q.5: 'A' Yes, it does. The State draft budget estimates presented to the State Assembly on 06/12/2017 but not publicly available up to 16/01/2018 when the Approved Budget was signed into Law.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A, Yes, it forms the basis for deliberation at the legislative level before its passage by SHoA

CIRDDOC:

6. How far in advance of the budget year are the State Draft Budget Estimates made publicly available?
- A. They are made publicly available at least three months before the start of the budget year.
 - B. They are made publicly available at least six weeks, but less than three months before the start of the budget year.
 - C. They are made publicly available less than six weeks before the start of the budget year.
 - D. They are made publicly available after the State Budget Appropriation Law has been passed, or they are not made available at all.
 - E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: State Draft Budget Estimates, presented to State House of Assembly on 06/12/2017 by the Executive Governor

Comment:Q.6: 'D' The State draft budget estimates presented to the State Assembly on 06/12/2017 but not publicly available up to 16/01/2018 when the Budget Approved to Law

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: D, It is made available after its passage into law

CIRDDOC:

7. Do the State Draft Budget Estimates or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by Ministries, Departments, or Agencies [MDAs])?
- A. Yes, all expenditures are classified by administrative unit.
 - B. Yes, at least two-thirds of the expenditures are classified by administrative unit (but not all).
 - C. Yes, less than two thirds of the expenditures are classified by administrative unit.
 - D. No, expenditures are not presented by administrative unit.
 - E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:Q.7: 'D' The State draft budget estimates presented to the State Assembly on 06/12/2017 but not publicly available up to 16/01/2018 when the Approved budget was signed into Law.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: D, Yes, all expenditures are classified by administrative or functional unit

8. Do the State Draft Budget Estimates or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year classified by functional classification?
- A. Yes, expenditures are presented by functional classification
 - B. No, expenditures are not presented by functional classification
 - C. Not applicable/other (please comment)

Citation:

Comment:Q.8: 'B' The State draft budget estimates presented to the State Assembly on 06/12/2017 but not publicly available up to 16/01/2018 when the Approved budget was signed into Law.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A, Yes, all expenditures are classified by administrative or functional unit

CIRDDOC:

9. Do the State Draft Budget Estimates or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year classified by economic classification?
- A. Yes, expenditures are presented by economic classification
 - B. No, expenditures are not presented by economic classification
 - C. Not applicable/other (please comment)

Citation:

Comment:Q.9: 'B' The State draft budget estimates presented to the State Assembly on 06/12/2017 but not publicly available up to 16/01/2018 when the Budget Approved to Law.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: B, No, all expenditures are classified as administrative or functional unit

CIRDDOC:

10. Do the State Draft Budget Estimates or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?
- A. Yes, programs accounting for all expenditures are presented.
 - B. Yes, programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented.
 - C. Yes, programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented.
 - D. No, expenditures are not presented by program.
 - E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:Q.10: 'D' The State draft budget estimates presented to the State Assembly on 06/12/2017 but not publicly available up to 16/01/2018 when the Budget Approved to Law.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: D, No, expenditure are not presented by program

CIRDDOC:

11. Does the State Draft Budget Estimates or any supporting budget documentation present the allocation of expenditures by gender, by age, or by senatorial zone or Local Government Area?
- A. Yes, the draft budget presents all three types of information (gender, age, senatorial zone and LGA)
 - B. Yes, the draft budget presents three of the four types of information
 - C. Yes, the draft budget presents less than three of the four types of information
 - D. **No, such information is not presented**
 - E. Not applicable/other (please comment)

Citation:

Comment:Q.11: 'D' The State draft budget estimates presented to the State Assembly on 06/12/2017 but not publicly available up to 16/01/2018 when the Approved budget was signed into Law.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: D, No, budget are not based on gender but MDAs

CIRDDOC:

12. Does the State Draft Budget Estimates or any supporting budget documentation present the individual sources of revenue (internally generated revenues such as turnover tax, VAT, or stamp duties and transfers from the federation account for the budget year?
- A. Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented.
 - B. Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenues are presented.
 - C. Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues are presented.
 - D. **No, individual sources of revenue are not presented.**
 - E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:Q.12: 'D' The State draft budget estimates presented to the State Assembly on 06/12/2017 but not publicly available up to 16/01/2018 when the Approved budget was signed into Law.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A, Yes, individual sources of revenue are identified and presented in the Budget.

CIRDDOC:

13. Does the State Draft Budget Estimates or any other supporting documentation present non-financial data on results (in terms of outputs or outcomes) for at least the budget year?
- A. Yes, non-financial data on results are provided for all programs [within all administrative units or functional totals].
 - B. Yes, non-financial data on results are presented for all administrative units (or functional totals) but not for all programs

- C. Yes, non-financial data on results are presented for some programs and/or some administrative units (or functional totals)
- D. No, non-financial data on results are not presented
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment)

Citation:

Comment: Q.13: "D" The State draft budget estimates presented to the State Assembly on 06/12/2017 but not publicly available up to 16/01/2018 when the Approved budget was signed into Law.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: D, No, non-financial data on result are not presented

CIRDDOC:

14. Are performance targets used for the non-financial data on results presented in the State Draft Budget Estimates or any supporting documentation?

- A. Yes, performance targets are used for all non-financial data
- B. Yes, performance targets are used for most non-financial data
- C. Yes, performance targets are used for some non-financial data
- D. No, performance targets are not used
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment)

Citation:

Comment: Q.14: 'D' Document is not publicly available

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: D, No, performance target are not presented in budget

CIRDDOC:

C. STATE BUDGET APPROPRIATION LAW (ENACTED BUDGET)

15. For the fiscal year under consideration, when was the State Budget Appropriation Law enacted?

- A. The State Budget Appropriation Law was enacted before the start of the fiscal year.
- B. The State Budget Appropriation Law was enacted within the first month of the next fiscal year.
- C. The State Budget Appropriation Law was enacted before the end of the first quarter of the next fiscal year but not within the first month.
- D. The State Budget Appropriation Law was not enacted before the end of the first quarter of the next fiscal year, or it was not produced at all.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

5. Citation: Yobe State Appropriation Law, 2018, 16/01/2018 <https://finance.ybpfm.org/yobe-state-financial-laws/>

Comment:Q.15: "B" The State Budget Appropriation Law, 2018 was enacted on 16/01/2018 which was within the first month of the next fiscal year.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: B, The state Appropriation Act is usually enacted within the first month of the fiscal year

CIRDDOC:

16. For the fiscal year under consideration, when is the State Budget Appropriation Law made publicly available?

- A. The State Budget Appropriation Law is made publicly available immediately after enactment.
- B. The State Budget Appropriation Law is made publicly available within less than six weeks after enactment.
- C. The State Budget Appropriation Law is made publicly available within 3 months after enactment (but more than 6 weeks after enactment).
- D. The State Budget Appropriation Law is made publicly available more than 3 months after enactment, or it is not made publicly available.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: 15/02/2018 <https://finance.ybpfm.org/yobe-state-financial-laws/>

Comment:Q.16: "B" The State Budget Appropriation Law is made publicly available on 15/02/2018 within less than six weeks after enactment 16/01/2018.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: "B" The Appropriation is made public in the first month after enactment

CIRDDOC:

17. Does the State Approved Budget present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (i.e. Ministries, Departments, or Agencies [MDAs])?

- A. Yes, all expenditures are presented by administrative unit.
- B. Yes, at least two thirds of the expenditures are presented by administrative unit (but not all).
- C. Yes, less than two thirds of expenditures are presented by administrative unit.
- D. No, expenditures not presented by administrative unit.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: Yobe State Government of Nigeria Approved Recurrent Expenditure, 2018 16th January, 2018 page 1 to 68

Comment:Q.17: "D" Document not Publicly available

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: "A" Approved budget is presented based on MDAs

CIRDDOC:

18. Does the State Approved Budget present expenditures for the budget year classified using functional classification?

- A. Yes, expenditures are presented by functional classification
- B. No, expenditures are not presented by functional classification
- C. Not applicable/other (please comment)

Citation: Yobe State Government of Nigeria Approved Budget, 2018 16th January, 2018 page 1 to 68

Comment:Q.18: "B" Yes, expenditures are presented by functional classification. page 1 - 68 functional code assigned. Document not publicly available

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: "A" budget is based on chart of accounts (functional classification)

CIRDDOC:

19. Does the State Approved Budget present expenditures for the budget year classified using economic classification?

- A. Yes, expenditures are presented by economic classification
- B. No, expenditures are not presented by economic classification
- C. Not applicable/other (please comment)

Citation: Yobe State Government of Nigeria Approved Recurrent Expenditure, 2018 16th January, 2018 page 1 to 68

Comment:Q.19: "B" Yes, expenditures are presented by economic classification.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: "A" Yes, expenditures are presented by economic classification.

CIRDDOC: Researcher's comment is correct, Document not publicly available

20. Does the State Approved Budget present expenditures for individual programs (items) for the budget year?

- A. Yes, programs accounting for all expenditures are presented.
- B. Yes, programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented.
- C. Yes, programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented.

- D. No, expenditures are not presented by program.
E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: Yobe State Government of Nigeria Approved Budget, 2018 16th January, 2018 page 1 to 68

Comment: Q.20: "D" Yes, programs accounting for all expenditure are presented. It shows the programmes in project description of the Budget, but document not publicly available

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A" Yes budget are based on program

CIRDDOC: Researcher's comment is correct, Document not publicly available

21. Do line items in the State Approved Estimates IPSAS complaint?

- A. Yes, all line items appeared with different codes across all MDAs
B. Yes, all line items appeared with different codes but not for more than 75 percent of the MDAs
C. Yes, all line items appeared with different codes but not for more than 50 percent of the MDAs
D. Yes, all line items appeared with different codes but for less than 25 percent of the MDAs or not publicly available
E. Not applicable (please comment)

Citation: Yobe State Government of Nigeria Approved Recurrent Expenditure, 2018 16th January, 2018 page 1 to 68

Comment: Q.21: "D" Yes, all line items appeared with different codes across all MDAs, but document not publicly available.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A, all line items are coded using national chart of account

CIRDDOC: Researcher's comment is correct, Document not publicly available

22. How many MDAs in the State Approved Budget have their budget lumped in a single or few items?

- A. None of the State MDAs budget line items were lumped in single or few items
B. Between 1 and 3 of the State MDAs have their Budget lumped into single of few items
C. Between 4 and 6 of the State MDAs have their Budget lumped into single of few items
D. More than 6 of the State MDAs have their Budget lumped into single of few items or not publicly available
E. Not applicable (please comment)

Citation: Yobe State Government of Nigeria Approved Recurrent Expenditure, 2018 16th

January, 2018 page 1 to 68

Comment:Q.22: "D" None of the State MDAs budget line items were lumped in single or few items, but document not publicly available.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A, None of the MDAs

CIRDDOC: Researcher's comment is correct, Document not publicly available

23. Does the State Approved Budget present the individual sources of revenue (internally generated revenues such as VAT, or stamp duties and transfers from the federal government) for the budget year?
- A. **Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented.**
 - B. Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenues are presented.
 - C. Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues are presented.
 - D. No, individual sources of revenue are not presented or not publicly available
 - E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: Yobe State Government of Nigeria Approved Budget, 2018 Summary _

Comment:Q. 23 "D" Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented, but document not publicly available.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A, Individual sources of revenue are presented

CIRDDOC: Researcher's comment is correct, Document not publicly available

D. STATE CITIZENS BUDGET

24. If produced, what information is provided in the State Citizens Budgets?

Please note that "core elements" must include: 1) information on the budget process; 2) revenue collection; 3) priority spending allocation; 4) sector specific information and targeted programs; 5) contact information for follow-up by citizens.

- A. A State Citizens Budget is produced, published and includes information on and beyond the core elements listed above.
- B. A State Citizens Budget is produced, published and provides information on the core elements listed above.
- C. A State Citizens Budget is produced, published but it excludes some of the core elements listed above.
- D. **A State Citizens Budget is not produced.**
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:Q.24: D, Not Produced

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: C, a citizen budget is produced by CSO but excludes some core elements

CIRDDOC:

25. How is the Citizens Budget disseminated to the public?

- A. A Citizens Budget is disseminated widely through a combination of at least three different appropriate tools and media (such as the Internet, billboards, radio programs, newspapers, street theatre, etc.).
- B. A Citizens Budget is disseminated by using at least two of the mechanisms described above.
- C. A State Citizens Budget is disseminated by using at least one of the mechanisms described above.
- D. A State Citizens Budget is not produced.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:Q.25: (D). Document not produced

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: B, citizen budget is disseminated through community based organizations (CBO) to the public

CIRDDOC:

E. STATE QUARTERLY EXECUTION REPORTS, STATE MID-YEAR REVIEW & THE STATE ACCOUNTANT-GENERAL REPORT

26. Does the state produce and release budget quarterly reports to the public?

- A. Yes, the state produces and release budget quarterly reports to the public
- B. Yes, the state produces but do not release budget quarterly reports to the public
- C. No, the state does not produce quarterly report
- D. Not applicable (please comment)

Citation: Yobe State Government of Nigeria Fourth quarter (Q4) budget performance report 2017 16/02/2018 <https://finance.ybpfm.org/budget-performance-report/>

Comment:Q.26: "A" Yes, the state produces and release quarterly budget performance to the public at State Public Finance Management web site.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A' the state produce quarterly reports and post online

CIRDDOC:

27. For quarterly reports released to the public by the state executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g. are quarterly reports released less than four weeks after the end of the quarter)?

- A. Quarterly Reports are released one month or less after the end of the period.
- B. Quarterly Reports are released two months or less (but more than one month) after the end of the period.
- C. Quarterly Reports are released more than two months (but less than three months) after the end of the period.
- D. Quarterly reports are released after three months or they are not released to the public.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: Yobe State Government of Nigeria Fourth quarter (Q4) budget performance report 2017 16/02/2018 <https://finance.ybpfm.org/budget-performance-report/>

Comment:Q.27: "B" Fourth Quarterly Report 2017 was released on 16/02/2018 two months or less (but more than one month) after the end of the period.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: Quarterly reports are produced and released within three months

CIRDDOC:

28. Does the state executive release to the public a Mid-Year Review of the budget?

- A. A Mid-Year Review is released one month or less after the end of the first six months of the budget year.
- B. A Mid-Year Review is released two months or less (but more than one month) after the first six months of the budget year.
- C. A Mid-Year Review is released more than two months (but less than three months) after the first six months of the budget year.
- D. A Mid-Year Review is released more than three months after the first six months of the budget year, or it is not produced at all.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:Q.28: 'D' Not produced

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: Mid-year review are produced within six months and sometimes not produced

CIRDDOC:

29. How long after the end of the budget year does the State Executive release to the public the Accountant General's Report that discusses the budget's actual outcome for the year?

- A. The report is released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.
- B. The report is released nine months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.
- C. The report is released 12 months or less (but more than 9 months) after the end of the fiscal year.
- D. The executive does not release an Accountant General's Report, or releases it too late (more than 12 months).
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: Yobe State Ministry of Finance and Economic Development office of Accountant General and Yobe State Public Finance Management web site, <https://finance.ybpfm.org/yobe-state-financial-statements/>

Comment:Q.29: "B" The State Executive released to the public The Accountant-General Report 2016 six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: The report is released usually within six month

CIRDDOC:

F. STATE AUDITOR GENERAL'S REPORT

30. How long after the end of the budget year are the final annual expenditures of State MDAs audited and released to the public by the Auditor General?

- A. Final audited accounts are released to the public 9 months or less after the end of the fiscal year.
- B. Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than nine months) after the end of the fiscal year.
- C. Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 18 months of the end of the fiscal year.
- D. Final audited accounts are not completed within 18 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: Yobe State Auditor-General Office, Yobe State Public Finance Management web site, <https://osag.yb.gov.ng/2016.pdf>

Comment:Q.30: "A" The State Auditor-General 2016 Report produced on May, 2017 less than 9 months after the end of fiscal year and publicly available in Yobe State Public Finance Management web site, <http://pfm.yb.gov.ng>

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A, less than 9 months

CIRDDOC:

31. When did the State House of Assembly (SHoA) receive the last Auditor General's report?

- A. The SHoA receives copies of the Auditor General report before the end of the next fiscal year
- B. The SHoA receives copies of the Auditor General report more than 12 months but less than 18 months after the fiscal year
- C. The SHoA receives copies of the Auditor General report more than 18 months but less than 24 months after the fiscal year
- D. No, the SHoA has not received the copy of the Auditor General report, or such report is yet to be produced.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:Q.31: "D" The SHoA receives copies of the Auditor-General report more than 12 months but less than 18 months after the fiscal year

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: B, the auditor general reports is received within 18 months after fiscal year

CIRDDOC: No evidence provided

SECTION TWO: PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IN THE BUDGET PROCESS

A. Public Engagement during Budget Formulation

32. Is the executive formally required to engage citizens during the budget formulation process?

- A. Yes, a law, regulation, or formal procedure obliges the executive to engage with a wide variety of citizens (civil society, trade unions, vulnerable groups, private sector, etc.) during the budget formulation process.
- B. Yes, a law, regulation, or formal procedure obliges the executive to engage with certain citizens during the budget formulation process.
- C. No, no formal requirement exists requiring the executive to engage with the public during the budget formulation process, but informal procedures exist to enable the public to engage with budget formulation.
- D. No, no formal requirement exists requiring the executive to engage with the public during the budget formulation process.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: Yobe state Ministry of Budget and Planning office of Director Budget.

Comment:Q.32: "D" No law or regulation publicly available in the State requiring executive to engage with public during budget formulation, but State budget committee provide budget call circular to all stakeholders in State, including civil societies, unions and professional associations.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: D there is no formal requirement for citizen engagement in budget process

CIRDDOC:

33. Has the state executive established practical mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budgets?
- A. Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget priorities; these mechanisms are accessible and widely used by the public.
 - B. Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget priorities; while these mechanisms are accessible they are not widely used by the public.
 - C. Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget priorities, but these mechanisms are not accessible.
 - D. No, the executive has not established any mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget priorities.
 - E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: Yobe State Ministry of Budget and Planning Call Circular for 2018 Budget

Comment:Q.33: "D" The State budget call circular provide priorities, but these mechanisms are not accessible.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: C. Yes through the budget circular

CIRDDOC:

34. Does the state executive hold consultations with the public on specific plans for vulnerable groups in the upcoming budget?

Please note that by "core set of constituencies" it is meant the following: 1. women's groups, 2. youth, 3. People living with disability and 4. Elderly

- A. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a core set of constituencies and others (Please specify).
- B. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a core set of constituencies.
- C. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few of the groups listed in the "core set of constituencies".
- D. No, the executive does not consult with the vulnerable groups as part of the budget preparation process.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: Yobe State Ministry of Budget and Planning Call Circular for 2018 Budget

Preparation Ref. No. MBEF/ES/S/20/VOL.1/1069 dated 10/08/2017 to State
Ministries, Departments and Agencies

Comment:Q.34: "D" No consultation with the vulnerable groups as part of the budget preparation process based on my survey contact Yobe state civil society platform on gender and vulnerable group and civil liberty organization members.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: D, no such consultation

CIRDDOC:

35. Does the state executive clearly, and in a timely manner, articulate its purpose for engaging the public during the budget formulation process?
- A. Yes, the executive articulates its purpose for engaging the public, clearly and in a timely manner.
 - B. Yes, the executive articulates its purpose for engaging the public in a timely manner, but some of the objectives are unclear/vague.
 - C. Yes, the executive articulates its purpose for engaging with the public, but not in a timely manner, and with vague/unclear description of its objectives.
 - D. No, the executive does not articulate its purpose for engaging the public during the budget formulation process, or does not engage with the public.
 - E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: Yobe State Ministry of Budget and Planning Call Circular for 2018 Budget

Preparation Ref. No. MBEF/ES/S/20/VOL.1/1069 dated 10/08/2017 to State

Ministries, Departments and Agencies

Comment:Q.35: "D"No any purpose stated clear on State call circular to stakeholders.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: D, no

CIRDDOC:

36. Does the state executive provide formal feedback to the public on how their inputs have been used to develop the State Draft Budget Estimates?
- A. Yes, the executive reports on the inputs it received from the public, and provides detailed feedback on how these inputs have been used to develop the State Draft Budget Estimates.
 - B. Yes, the executive reports on the inputs it received from the public, and provides *limited* feedback on how these inputs have been used to develop the State Draft Budget Estimates.
 - C. Yes, the executive reports on the inputs it received from the public, but these reports provide no feedback on how these inputs have been used to develop the State Draft Budget Estimates.
 - D. No, the executive does not report on the inputs it received from the public or provide any feedback on how these inputs have been used to develop the State Draft Budget Estimates.
 - E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:Q.36: "D" Civil Society sometimes provide inputs to line MDAs in the State but no any feedback on how these inputs used based on by survey to Yobe Stat Civil Society Network.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: D' No

CIRDDOC:

B. Public Engagement during Budget Discussion by State House of Assembly

37. Does the state assembly [appropriations] committee hold public hearings on the individual budgets of state government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive is heard?
- A. Yes, public hearings in which testimony from the executive branch is heard are held on the budgets of a wide range of administrative units.
 - B. Yes, public hearings in which testimony from the executive branch is heard are held on the budgets of the main administrative units.
 - C. Yes, public hearings in which testimony from the executive branch is heard are held on the budgets of a small number of administrative units.
 - D. No, public hearings in which testimony from the executive branch is heard are not held on the budgets of administrative units.
 - E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: Yobe State House of Assembly

Comment: Q.37 "B" State House of Assembly invite Ministries, Department and Agencies to defend their budget ceiling before the House where media and civil societies participated. Based on by survey visit to Yobe civil society platform, Voice and Accountability

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: B, yes they do

CIRDDOC:

38. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (i.e., MDAs) in which testimony from the public are heard?
- A. Yes, public hearings in which testimony from the public is heard are held on the budgets of a wide range of administrative units.
 - B. Yes, public hearings in which testimony from the public is heard are held on the budgets of some administrative units.
 - C. Yes, public hearings in which testimony from the public is heard are held on the budgets of a small number of administrative units.
 - D. No, public hearings in which testimony from the public is heard are not held on the budgets of administrative units.
 - E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: Yobe State House of Assembly

Comment: Q.38: "D" State Assembly hold public hearings, but no testimony from the public is heard on the budgets of administrative units.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: D" no public hearing for public opinion

CIRDDOC:

39. Do the state assembly committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?
- A. Yes, the committees release reports, which include all written and spoken testimony presented at the hearings.
 - B. Yes, the committees release reports, which include most testimony presented at the hearings.

- C. Yes, the committees release reports, but they include only some testimony presented at the hearings.
- D. No, the committees do not release reports, or do not hold public hearings.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:Q.39: "D" No any committees report publicly available based on survey visits in the State Assembly and survey discussions with Yobe civil society voice and accountability platform.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: D" no

CIRDDOC:

C. Public Engagement during Budget Execution

40. Does the state executive publish a list of beneficiaries of projects, subsidies, social plans and other targeted spending from MDAs?
- A. Yes, a complete list of beneficiaries is published for all targeted spending.
- B. The government publishes the list of beneficiaries for only some portions of targeted spending.
- C. Information on beneficiaries is very limited.
- D. There is no information on beneficiaries of targeted spending.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:Q.40: "D" no information on beneficiaries of targeted spending publicly available in the State web site and 2018 budget <http://pfm.yb.gov.ng>.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: D, no

CIRDDOC:

41. Has the state executive established practical mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget execution?
- A. Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget execution: these mechanisms are accessible and widely used by the public.
- B. Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget execution: while these mechanisms are accessible, they are not widely used by the public.
- C. Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget execution, but these mechanisms are not accessible.
- D. No, the executive has not established any mechanisms to identify the public's perspective on budget execution.

E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:Q.41: "D" No any mechanism provided by executive for the public's perspective on budget execution, while all contact on state budget authorities are on state

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: D, No

CIRDDOC:

42. Does the state executive provide formal feedback to the public on how their inputs have been used to improve budget execution?

- A. Yes, the executive reports on the inputs it received from the public, and provides detailed feedback on how these inputs have been used to improve budget execution.
- B. Yes, the executive reports on the inputs it received from the public, and provides *limited* feedback on how these inputs have been used to improve budget execution.
- C. Yes, the executive reports on the inputs it received from the public, but provides no feedback on how these inputs have been used to improve budget execution.
- D. **No, the executive does not report on the inputs it received from the public or provide any feedback on how these inputs have been used to improve budget execution.**
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Comment:Q.42: "D" No any feed-back executive provide to the Stakeholders that make an inputs to MDAs, based on my survey to State Civil Society Network in the State.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: D, No

CIRDDOC:

D. Public Engagement during Audit

43. Does the state Auditor General's office maintain formal mechanisms through which the public can participate in the audit process?

- a. Yes, the state General Auditor's office has established formal mechanisms through which the public can participate in the audit process. These mechanisms are accessible and widely used by the public.
- b. Yes, the state General Auditor's office has established formal mechanisms through which the public can participate in the audit process. While these mechanisms are accessible, they are not widely used by the public.
- c. Yes, the state General Auditor's office has established formal mechanisms through which the public can participate in the audit process, but these mechanisms are not accessible.
- d. **No, the state General Auditor's office does not maintain any formal mechanisms through which the public can participate in the audit process.**
- e. Not applicable.

Citation: Yobe State Auditor-General Office, Yobe State Public Finance Management web site,
http://pfm.yb.gov.ng

Comment:Q.43: "D" the state Auditor-General office has web site and office contact detail on line but any formal mechanisms through which the public can participate in the audit process.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: D, No

CIRDDOC:

44. Are the state assembly meetings that discuss the Auditor General's Report open to the public?

- A. Yes, the meetings discussing the audit report are open to the public.
- B. **No, the meetings discussing the audit report are not open to the public.**
- C. Not applicable /other (please explain).

Citation:

Comment:Q.44: "B" No, any report publicly available on the meetings discussing the audit report open to the public based on my visits and discussions the Yobe State Civil Society Network members.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: B, no the meeting is not opened to the public

CIRDDOC:

SECTION THREE: TRANSPARENCY IN THE PROCUREMENT SYSTEM

45. Is there a Public Procurement Law (PPL) regulating the procurement process in the state?

- A. **Yes, there is a Public Procurement Law that is publicly available.**
- B. There is no Public Procurement Law, but there is an established process regulating procurement, and that is publicly available.
- C. There is a legal framework or an established process regulating procurement, but that is not available to the public.
- D. No, there is no legal framework or process regulating procurement.
- E. Not applicable (please comment).

Citation: Yobe State Bureau on Public Procurement Law, 2016

Comment:Q.45: "A" there is a Public Procurement Law, publicly available.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A, yes

CIRDDOC:

46. Does the state have a Public Procurement Bureau/Office that implement the PPL in regulating public procurement in the state?

- A. Yes, there is a Public Procurement Bureau/Office that implement the PPL in regulating public procurement
- B. No, there is no Public Procurement Bureau/Office but the state has a Due Process Office (DPO) that implement the PPL in regulating public procurement
- C. The State uses the Tenders Board for all public procurement
- D. The State has no Public Procurement Bureau/Office, Due Process Office or Tenders Board
- E. Not applicable (please comment).

Citation: Yobe State Bureau for Public Procurement Law, 2016

Comment:Q.46: "A" there is a Public Procurement Bureau/Office that implement the PPL in regulating public procurement at Yobe State Bureau for Public Procurement Office, Maiduguri Road, Damaturu.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A, yes

CIRDDOC:

47. Has the State inaugurated a Public Procurement Council in line with the provision of the PPL with both Private sector and Civil Society Representatives as members

- A. Yes, the State has inaugurated a Public Procurement Council in line with the provision of the PPL with both Private sector and Civil Society Representative as members
- B. Yes, the State has inaugurated a Public Procurement Council in line with the provision of the PPL with only one member from either Private sector or Civil Society as members
- C. Yes, the State has inaugurated a Public Procurement Council in line with the provision of the PPL with no representation from either Private sector or Civil Society as members
- D. No, the State has not inaugurated a Public Procurement Council in line with the provision of the PPL
- E. Not applicable (please comment).

Citation: Bureau for Public Procurement Law, 2016

Comment:Q.47: "D" Yobe State Bureau for Public Procurement Law, 2016 page 36.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A, yes

CIRDDOC: Council not established.

48. Does the state make available to the public from a single source (for example a Public Procurement Bureau/Office or the State Tenders Board) that launch announcements of open public procurement tenders by its Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs)?

- A. Yes, there is a Public Procurement Bureau/Office or the State Tenders Board that provides information on all public tenders.

- B. Yes, there is a Public Procurement Bureau/Office or the State Tenders Board that provides information on public tenders, but a minority of tenders is separately published by MDAs.
- C. No, there is no Public Procurement Bureau/Office or the State Tenders Board, but information on individual tenders can be accessed from the procuring MDAs
- D. No information of public tenders is available within the state.
- E. Not applicable (please comment).

Citation: Yobe State Bureau for Public Procurement Law, 2016

Comment:Q.48: "D" Yobe State Bureau for Public Procurement Law, 2016 page 14.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A, yes

CIRDDOC:

49. How regularly do MDAs in the state invite CSOs and other stakeholders' representatives during bid openings?

- A. The MDAs in the state invite CSOs and other stakeholders' representatives regularly during bid openings
- A. The MDAs in the state invite CSOs and other stakeholders' representatives sometimes during bid openings
- B. The MDAs in the state do not invite CSOs and other stakeholders' representatives during bid openings
- C. Not applicable (please comment)

Citation: Yobe State Bureau for Public Procurement Law, 2016

Comment:Q.49: "C" The MDAs in the state invite CSOs and other stakeholders' representatives regularly during bid openings page.36 Yobe State Bureau for Public Procurement Law, 2016 page 36.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A, as at when due

CIRDDOC: No proof provided

50. If there is a Public Procurement Bureau/Office or State Tenders Board, how does the State publish contracts guidance documentation (including at least: instructions, application forms, requirements, and evaluation criteria.)?

- A. The Public Procurement Bureau/Office or the State Tenders Board publishes contracts information through multiple means (including: online portals, official gazette, radio announcements, billboards), and publishes all guidance documentation
- B. The Public Procurement Bureau/Office or the State Tenders Board uses only one publication method, but publishes all guidance documentation.
- C. The Public Procurement Bureau/Office or the State Tenders Board directly contacts the contractors, and does not make all guidance documentation available to everyone in a single place.

- D. The Public Procurement Bureau/Office or the State Tenders Board does not publish available contracts.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: Office of Yobe State Bureau for Public Procurement, Maiduguri Road, Damaturu.

Comment:Q50: "D" Yobe State Bureau for Public Procurement Law, 2016 page 25.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A" through the boards and media

CIRDDOC:

51. Following the closing date for bid submission, are tenders opened publicly?

- A. Yes, tenders are opened publicly immediately following the closing date for bid submission.
- B. Yes, tenders are opened publicly, but there is a delay in opening some of them
- C. Yes, tenders are opened publicly, but there is always a delay in opening them
- D. Tenders are not opened publicly at all.
- E. Not applicable (please comment).

Citation:.

Comment:Q.51: "C" Tenders are opened publicly immediately following the closing date for bid submission. Yobe State Bureau for Public Procurement Law, 2016 page 49, but not regularly

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A, yes

CIRDDOC:

52. Are procurement decisions published?

- A. All procurement decisions are publicly posted on a government website or another easily accessible place.
- B. All procurement decisions are posted in a somewhat restricted access media (e.g. the official gazette of limited circulation).
- C. Publication of procurement decisions is not mandatory, and is left to the discretion of the review bodies making access difficult.
- D. Procurement decisions are never published.
- E. Not applicable (please comment)

Citation:

Comment:Q.52 "D" Yobe State Bureau for Public Procurement Law, 2016 page 14.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: B, yes but not for public

CIRDDOC:

53. Is the justification for awarding the contract to the selected contractor published?

- A. Yes, the justification for awarding the contract to the selected contractor is published.
- B. No, the justification for awarding the contract to the selected contractor is not published.
- C. Not applicable (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:Q.53: "B"

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A, yes

CIRDDOC:

54. Is there an external procurement complaints review body?

- A. Yes, there is an external procurement complaints review body; individuals know how to submit complaints; and the review body works well
- B. Yes, there is an external procurement complaints review body; individuals how to submit complaints; but the review body does not work well.
- C. Yes, there is an external procurement complaints review body, but not it is not clear to all individuals how to submit a complaint; and the review body does not work well.
- D. No, there is no external procurement complaints review body.
- E. Not applicable (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:Q.54: "D" No, there is no external procurement complaints review body.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: D no

CIRDDOC:

55. Is there an Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR) mechanism related to procurement bid documents and contract award decisions publicly available?

- A. Yes, there is an Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR) mechanism; individuals know how to use it; and the mechanism works well.
- B. Yes, there is an Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR) mechanism; individuals know how to use it; but the alternative resolution mechanism does *not* work well
- C. Yes, there is an Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR) mechanism, but: individual generally do *not* know how it works and the mechanism does *not* work well.
- D. No, there is no Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR) mechanism
- E. Not applicable (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:Q.55: "D" No, there is no Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR) mechanism

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: D, no

CIRDDOC:

56. Does the State have Procurement Complaints Review body that look at disputes over procurement processes?

- A. Yes, the State has a Procurement Complaints Review body that look at disputes over procurement processes and they meet at regular intervals
- B. Yes, the State has a Procurement Complaints Review body that look at disputes over procurement processes but meet at irregular intervals
- C. No, the State has no Procurement Complaints Review body that look at disputes over procurement processes
- D. Not applicable (please comment).

Citation:

Comment: Q.56: "C" No, the State has no Procurement Complaints Review body that look at disputes over procurement processes

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: C, No

CIRDDOC:

57. Are the decisions of the procurement complaints review body regarding disputes over procurement processes made available on a timely basis to the citizens?

- A. All the decisions of the procurement complaints review body are made publicly available at a known source of information, within 30 days.
- B. Most decisions of the procurement complaints review body are made publicly available at a known source of information, within 30 days, but a minority of decisions are publicized in different places.
- C. There is no single pre-established source for the publication of the decisions of the procurement complaints review body but all such decisions can be accessed from the procuring entities within 30 days.
- D. Decisions of the procurement complaints review body are not made publicly available, or they are communicated more than 30 days after their adjudication, or no external procurement complaints review body exists.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment: Q.57: "D" Decisions of the procurement complaints review body are not made publicly available, or they are communicated more than 30 days after their adjudication, or no external procurement complaints review body exists.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: D, no

58. What percentage of all capital projects in the state were initiated through open and competitive tender as against the special and restricted methods of public procurement?

- A. Above 75 percent of the capital projects initiated through open and competitive tender
- B. Between 50 -74 percent of the capital projects initiated through open and competitive tender

- C. Between 25-49 percent of the capital projects initiated through open and competitive tender
- D. Less than 24 percent of the capital projects initiated through open and competitive tender
- E. Not applicable

Citation:

Comment:Q.58: "D" Yobe State Bureau for Public Procurement Law, 2016 page 25

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A above 75%

CIRDDOC:

59. Does the state executive publish information on awarded contracts for community projects on a regular basis?
- A. The state publishes: 1) a list of all awarded contracts, 2) the amount of payment made to each contractor, and 3) the corresponding percentage of payment made to each contractor (out of the total amount).
- B. The state publishes: 1) a list of all awarded contracts and 2) the amount of payment made to each contractor.
- C. The state only publishes a list of awarded contracts.
- D. The state does not publish any information on contracts for community projects.
- E. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: Yobe State Bureau of Public Procurement Law, 2016

Comment:Q.59: "D" Yobe State Bureau for Public Procurement Law, 2016 page 14

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: B, contracts and amount are published and made public

CIRDDOC: No evidence provided

SECTION FOUR: LEGAL FRAMEWORK: ACCESS TO INFORMATION AND FISCAL RESPONSIBILITY

60. Is there a State Freedom of Information Law?
- A. Yes, there is a State Freedom of Information Law with concrete Access to Information mechanisms.
- B. Yes, there is a State Freedom of Information Law with vague Access to Information mechanisms.
- C. No, there is no State Freedom of Information Law, but there is another provision ensuring Access to Information.
- D. No, there is no State Freedom of Information Law
- E. Not applicable (please comment).

Citation:**Comment:Q.60: "D"** The State has no freedom of information Law.**Govt. Review:****Ind. Review: D, No****CIRDDOC:**

61. Is there a State Access to Information Agency that ensures access to Information?

- A. Yes, there is a State Access to Information Agency with the authority and mechanisms to enforce information requests from citizens.
- B. Yes, there is a State Access to Information Agency but it does not have the authority or mechanisms to enforce information requests from citizens.
- C. No, there is no State Access to Information Agency, but citizens can use the courts as an enforcement mechanism.
- D. **No, there is no State Access to Information Agency.**
- E. Not applicable (please comment).

Citation:**Comment:Q.61: "****Govt. Review:****Ind. Review: A" Yes****CIRDDOC:**

62. Are there any specific legal provisions ensuring the public availability of budget documents?

- A. **Yes, there are specific provisions ensuring the publication of budget documents in the State Organic Public Finance Management (PFM) Law or other legal provisions.**
- B. No, there are no specific provisions ensuring the publication of budget documents.
- C. Not applicable (please comment).

Citation: Yobe State Fiscal Responsibility Law, July, 2016**Comment:Q.62: "A"** Yobe State has Public Finance Management committee with ensure legal provision of budget in the State.**Govt. Review:****Ind. Review: A yes****CIRDDOC:**

63. Is there a State Fiscal Responsibility Law?

- A. **Yes, there is a State Fiscal Responsibility Law.**
- B. No, there is no State Fiscal Responsibility Law.
- C. Not applicable (please comment).

Citation: Yobe State Fiscal Responsibility Law, July, 2016

Comment: "A" Annual Report and Audited Accounts of the Fiscal Responsibility Board for the Year ended 31st December, 2017 and Yobe State Fiscal Responsibility Law, 22/07/2016 page 25

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A, yes

CIRDDOC:

64. Does the State prepare Medium-Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) and Fiscal Strategy Paper (FSP) in line with the provisions of the Fiscal Responsibility Law (FRL)?

- A. The State prepares an MTEF and FSP regularly (annually) in line with the provisions of the Fiscal Responsibility Law (FRL)
- B. The State prepares an MTEF and FSP but not regularly (annually) in line with the provisions of the Fiscal Responsibility Law (FRL)
- C. The State prepares an MTEF but does not prepare FSP in line with the provisions of the Fiscal Responsibility Law (FRL)
- D. The State does not prepare an MTEF and FSP
- E. Not applicable

Citation: Yobe State Fiscal Responsibility Law, July, 2016

Comment: Q.64: "A" Annual Report and Audited Accounts of the Fiscal Responsibility Board for the Year ended 31st December, 2017 page

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A, MTEF and FSP are prepared annually

CIRDDOC:

65. Is there evidence of public (including Civil Society/Non-Governmental Organisations, organised labour, professional associations and organised private sector working in the sector) consultation during the preparation of the MTEF and FSP?

- A. There is evidence of public (including Civil Society/Non-Governmental Organisations, organised labour, professional associations and organised private sector working in the sector) consultation during the preparation of the MTEF and FSP
- B. There is no evidence of public (including Civil Society/Non-Governmental Organisations, organised labour, professional associations and organised private sector working in the sector) consultation during the preparation of the MTEF and FSP
- C. Not applicable (please comment)

Citation: Yobe State Fiscal Responsibility Law, July, 2016

Comment:Q.66: "A"Yobe State Auditor-General Annual Report, 2016 page 20 and Yobe State Fiscal Responsibility Law, 22/07/2016 page 25.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A yes

CIRDDOC:

66. Does the State have a Modern Audit Law?

- A. Yes, the State Audit Law is less than 5 years old
- B. Yes, the State Audit law is less than 10 years old
- C. Yes, the State Audit law is more than 10 years but less than 20 years
- D. No, the state Audit law is more than 20 years or there is no such law.
- E. Not applicable (please comment)

Citation: Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, 1999 section 125 sub-section 1 & 2

Comment:Q.66: "A"Yobe State Auditor-General Annual Report, 2016 page 20 and Yobe State Fiscal Responsibility Law, 22/07/2016 page 25.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A yes

CIRDDOC:

67. Is there a legal framework requiring the Auditor General to submit its report to the State House of Assembly?

- A. Yes, there is such a legal framework.
- B. No, there is no legal framework.
- C. Not applicable (please comment).

Citation: Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, 1999 section 125 sub-section 1 & 2

Comment:Q.67: "A"Yobe State Auditor-General Annual Report, 2016 page 20.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A, Yes

CIRDDOC:

68. Does the Public Accounts Committee (PAC) of the State House of Assembly produce a report based on their findings from the Auditor General's Report?

- A. Yes, the Public Accounts Committee (PAC) produces a report based on their findings from the Auditor General's Report
- B. No, the Public Accounts Committee (PAC) do not produce any report based on their findings from the Auditor General's Report.
- C. Not applicable (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:Q.68: "B"Based on my survey visits to the State Assembly and discussion with desk officer i/c of civil society in the State Assembly said the document not publicly available.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A, Yes

CIRDDOC:

69. When was the last report on Auditor General's report produced by the Public Accounts Committee (PAC) of the State House of Assembly
- The Public Accounts Committee (PAC) has reports for all Auditor General's report submitted to them.
 - The Public Accounts Committee (PAC) have reports for all Auditor General's report submitted to them with the exception of the last fiscal year which they are still working on
 - The Public Accounts Committee (PAC) have reports for up to 50 percent of the Auditor General's report submitted to them
 - The Public Accounts Committee (PAC) have no reports from the Auditor General's report submitted to them
 - Not applicable (please comment)

Citation:

Comment:Q.69: "D"Public Accounts Committee no report publicly available.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: C, report for up to 50%

CIRDDOC:

70. When last was the State Financial Regulations/Instructions reviewed?
- The State Financial Regulations/Instructions was reviewed within the last 5 years
 - The State Financial Regulations/Instructions was reviewed within the last 10 years but more than 5 years.
 - The State Financial Regulations/Instructions was reviewed more than 10 years ago but less than 15 years
 - The State Financial Regulations/Instructions was reviewed more than 15 years ago or there is no such law.
 - Not applicable (please comment).

Citation: Yobe State Finance Law, 2018

Comment:Q.70: "A"Yobe State Financial Regulation, 2018 reviewed annually, 16/01/2018.

Govt. Review:

Ind. Review: A, within 5 years

CIRDDOC:

APPENDIX 1



